# - Connecting You to <br> E Health Coverage <br> \& Health Quality 

DHA Board of Trustees Discussion Document May 9, 2011

## Revised Options

At the end of SFY11 we anticipate approximately 15,600 people enrolled in all programs:
DirigoChoice - 8539 members (including HCTC and PCIP enrollment). 6233 subsidized, 2306 unsubsidized.
The Agency presented a series of options to the Board on April 4, 2011. These are displayed in gray in the table below.
The Board requested that the Agency consider how to keep the program open until June 30, 2012 by examining the following program changes:

1) raising all deductibles by $\$ 250.00$
2) reducing / consolidating subsidies
a. Into 3 subsidy levels
b. Into 2 subsidy level

The Agency determined that keeping the program open until June 30, 2012 would require an approximate reduction of $18 \%$ in its subsidy expense effective July 1, 2011 on all contracts.

| Option | Program Capped | Peak Enrollment |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Add $\$ 250$ to every deductible in all subsidy levels. | January 1, 2012 | 9,500 members, 7,000 subsidized |
| $1.03 \%$ savings when rolled in on anniversary date starting July 1, 2010. |  |  |
| Merge 4 subsidy levels into 3 on July 1, 2011 | May 1, 2012 | 10,200 members, subsidized 7,500 |
| B: $80 \% \rightarrow 70 \%$ |  |  |
| C: $60 \% \rightarrow 50 \%$ |  |  |
| D: $40 \% \rightarrow 20 \%$ |  |  |
| E: $20 \% \rightarrow 20 \%$ |  |  |
| Projected $15.29 \%$ savings over a 30 month period. |  |  |
| Add $\$ 250$ to every deductible in all subsidy levels (see above). |  |  |
| Total saving for this option: $16.31 \%$ |  |  |


| Option | Program Capped | Peak Enrollment |
| :--- | :--- | :--- |
| Merge 4 subsidy levels into 2 on July 1, 2011 | July 1, 2012 | 10,400, subsidized 7,700 |
| B: $80 \% \rightarrow 70 \%$ |  |  |
| C: $60 \% \rightarrow 35 \%$ |  |  |
| D: $40 \% \rightarrow 35 \%$ |  |  |
| E: $20 \% \rightarrow 35 \%$ |  |  |
| Projected $19.27 \%$ savings over a 30 month period. |  |  |
|  |  |  |
| No changes in benefits or subsidy in DirigoChoice. | January 1, 2012 | 9,500 members, 7,000 subsidized |
| Change DirigoChoice program design to reduce Agency subsidy cost by <br> $13 \%$ (shifting to $\$ 2,500$ deductible on October 1, 2011, effective on <br> renewal) | March 1, 2012 | 10,000 members, 7,400 subsidized |
| Change DirigoChoice program design to reduce Agency subsidy cost by <br> $27 \%$ (shifting to $\$ 5,000$ deductible on October 1, 2011, effective on <br> renewal). | October 1, 2012 | 11,500 members, 8,500 subsidized |
| Change DirigoChoice program design to reduce Agency subsidy cost by <br> $49 \%$ (shift to $\$ 5,000$ deductible for entire population on October 1, 2011, <br> eliminate pharmacy coverage). | NA |  |

- Consistent with current practice, subsidy levels in "merge" options reflect the \% of the "base" (or F) premium the member must pay. DHA would continue to pay incremental costs, i.e., the additional amounts required to support the reduced deductible and out-of-pocket limits associated with each subsidy level.
- Adverse selection, retention based on higher costs, and/or impact on growth trend with new product/subsidy design may impact membership projections.

Current DirigoChoice Member Fixed Premium Costs and Out of Pocket Risk by Subsidy Level

|  |  | Household Income | Deductible | \% Income | OOP Max | \% Income |  | Annual Premium | \% Income | Total Risk \% Income |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sole Prop |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 2 (1750) | B | \$ 13,382.69 | \$500 | 4\% | \$ 1,600 | 12\% |  | \$ 4,539.33 | 34\% | 46\% |
|  | C | \$ 21,448.22 | \$800 | 4\% | \$ 2,600 | 12\% |  | \$ 5,073.36 | 24\% | 36\% |
|  | D | \$ 30,313.03 | \$1,125 | 4\% | \$ 3,600 | 12\% |  | \$ 5,607.40 | 18\% | 30\% |
|  | E | \$ 36,900.08 | \$1,450 | 4\% | \$ 4,600 | 12\% |  | \$ 6,141.44 | 17\% | 29\% |
| Plan 3 (2500) | B | \$ 13,382.69 | \$500 | 4\% | \$ 700 | 5\% |  | \$ 4,541.86 | 34\% | 39\% |
|  | C | \$ 21,448.22 | \$1,000 | 5\% | \$ 1,400 | 7\% |  | \$ 5,076.19 | 24\% | 30\% |
|  | D | \$ 30,313.03 | \$1,500 | 5\% | \$ 2,100 | 7\% |  | \$ 5,610.53 | 19\% | 25\% |
|  | E | \$ 36,900.08 | \$2,000 | 5\% | \$ 2,800 | 8\% |  | \$ 6,144.86 | 17\% | 24\% |
| Individual |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 2 (1750) | B | \$ 11,676.38 | \$500 | 4\% | \$ 1,600 | 14\% |  | \$ 1,335.10 | 11\% | 25\% |
|  | C | \$ 20,138.27 | \$800 | 4\% | \$ 2,600 | 13\% |  | \$ $2,670.19$ | 13\% | 26\% |
|  | D | \$ 32,236.48 | \$1,125 | 3\% | \$ 3,600 | 11\% |  | \$ 4,005.29 | 12\% | 24\% |
|  | E | \$ 38,966.27 | \$1,450 | 4\% | \$ 4,600 | 12\% |  | \$ 5,340.38 | 14\% | 26\% |
| Plan 3 (2500) | B | \$ 11,676.38 | \$500 | 4\% | \$ 700 | 6\% |  | \$ 1,335.84 | 11\% | 17\% |
|  | C | \$ 20,138.27 | \$1,000 | 5\% | \$ 1,400 | 7\% |  | \$ 2,671.68 | 13\% | 20\% |
|  | D | \$ 32,236.48 | \$1,500 | 5\% | \$ 2,100 | 7\% |  | \$ 4,007.52 | 12\% | 19\% |
|  | E | \$ 38,966.27 | \$2,000 | 5\% | \$ 2,800 | 7\% |  | \$ 5,343.36 | 14\% | 21\% |
| Small Group |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 1 (1250) | B | \$ 18,308.03 | \$250 | 1\% | \$ 800 | 4\% |  | \$ 413.79 | 2\% | 7\% |
|  | C | \$ 26,362.72 | \$500 | 2\% | \$ 1,600 | 6\% |  | \$ 827.58 | 3\% | 9\% |
|  | D | \$ 35,176.38 | \$750 | 2\% | \$ 2,400 | 7\% |  | \$ 1,241.37 | 4\% | 10\% |
|  | E | \$ 38,391.65 | \$1,000 | 3\% | \$ 3,200 | 8\% |  | \$ 1,655.16 | 4\% | 13\% |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 2 (1750) | B | \$ 18,308.03 | \$500 | 3\% | \$ 1,600 | 9\% |  | \$ 381.59 | 2\% | 11\% |
|  | C | \$ 26,362.72 | \$800 | 3\% | \$ 2,600 | 10\% |  | \$ 763.17 | 3\% | 13\% |
|  | D | \$ 35,176.38 | \$1,125 | 3\% | \$ 3,600 | 10\% |  | \$ 1,144.76 | 3\% | 13\% |
|  | E | \$ 38,391.65 | \$1,450 | 4\% | \$ 4,600 | 12\% |  | \$ 1,526.34 | 4\% | 16\% |
| Plan 3 (2500) |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
|  | B | \$ 18,308.03 | \$500 | 3\% | \$ 700 | 4\% |  | \$ 381.84 | 2\% | 6\% |
|  | C | \$ 26,362.72 | \$1,000 | 4\% | \$ 1,400 | 5\% |  | \$ 763.69 | 3\% | 8\% |
|  | D | \$ 35,176.38 | \$1,500 | 4\% | \$ 2,100 | 6\% |  | \$ 1,145.53 | 3\% | 9\% |
|  | E | \$ 38,391.65 | \$2,000 | 5\% | \$ 2,800 | 7\% |  | \$ 1,527.37 | 4\% | 11\% |

## Comparison of Current Deductible and Premium with increased \$250 Deductible and Premium

|  |  | Current Deductible | $\begin{aligned} & \text { Deductible + } \\ & \$ 250 \end{aligned}$ | \% Increase in Deductible | Current Annual Premium | \% Reduction in Premium | New Annual Premium | \$ Reduction in Premium |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| Sole Prop |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 2 (1750) | B | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$4,539.33 | 2.3\% | \$ 4,434.93 | \$104.40 |
|  | C | \$800 | \$1,050 | 31\% | \$5,073.36 | 2.1\% | \$ 4,966.82 | \$106.54 |
|  | D | \$1,125 | \$1,375 | 22\% | \$5,607.40 | 2.0\% | \$ 5,495.25 | \$112.15 |
|  | E | \$1,450 | \$1,700 | 17\% | \$6,141.44 | 1.9\% | \$ 6,024.75 | \$116.69 |
| Plan 3 (2500) | B | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$4,541.86 | 2.6\% | \$ 4,423.77 | \$118.09 |
|  | C | \$1,000 | \$1,250 | 25\% | \$5,076.19 | 2.3\% | \$ 4,959.44 | \$116.75 |
|  | D | \$1,500 | \$1,750 | 17\% | \$5,610.53 | 2.3\% | \$ 5,481.49 | \$129.04 |
|  | E | \$2,000 | \$2,250 | 13\% | \$6,144.86 | 1.5\% | \$ 6,052.69 | \$92.17 |
| Individual |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 2 (1750) | B | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$1,335.10 | 2.3\% | \$ 1,304.39 | \$30.71 |
|  | C | \$800 | \$1,050 | 31\% | \$2,670.19 | 2.1\% | \$ 2,614.12 | \$56.07 |
|  | D | \$1,125 | \$1,375 | 22\% | \$4,005.29 | 2.0\% | \$ 3,925.18 | \$80.11 |
|  | E | \$1,450 | \$1,700 | 17\% | \$5,340.38 | 1.9\% | \$ 5,238.91 | \$101.47 |
| Plan 3 (2500) | B | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$1,335.84 | 2.6\% | \$ 1,301.11 | \$34.73 |
|  | c | \$1,000 | \$1,250 | 25\% | \$2,671.68 | 2.3\% | \$ 2,610.23 | \$61.45 |
|  | D | \$1,500 | \$1,750 | 17\% | \$4,007.52 | 2.3\% | \$ 3,915.35 | \$92.17 |
|  | E | \$2,000 | \$2,250 | 13\% | \$5,343.36 | 1.5\% | \$ 5,263.21 | \$80.15 |
| Small Group |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| Plan 1 (1250) | B | \$250 | \$500 | 100\% | \$413.79 | 2.6\% | \$403.03 | \$10.76 |
|  | C | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$827.58 | 2.3\% | \$808.55 | \$19.03 |
|  | D | \$750 | \$1,000 | 33\% | \$1,241.37 | 2.2\% | \$1,214.06 | \$27.31 |
|  | E | \$1,000 | \$1,250 | 25\% | \$1,655.16 | 2.1\% | \$1,620.40 | \$34.76 |
| Plan 2 (1750) | B | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$381.59 | 2.3\% | \$ 372.81 | \$8.78 |
|  | C | \$800 | \$1,050 | 31\% | \$763.17 | 2.1\% | \$ 747.14 | \$16.03 |
|  | D | \$1,125 | \$1,375 | 22\% | \$1,144.76 | 2.0\% | \$ 1,121.86 | \$22.90 |
|  | E | \$1,450 | \$1,700 | 17\% | \$1,526.34 | 1.9\% | \$ 1,497.34 | \$29.00 |
| Plan 3 (2500) | B | \$500 | \$750 | 50\% | \$381.84 | 2.6\% | \$ 371.91 | \$9.93 |
|  | C | \$1,000 | \$1,250 | 25\% | \$763.69 | 2.3\% | \$ 746.13 | \$17.56 |
|  | D | \$1,500 | \$1,750 | 17\% | \$1,145.53 | 2.3\% | \$ 1,119.18 | \$26.35 |
|  | E | \$2,000 | \$2,250 | 13\% | \$1,527.37 | 1.5\% | \$ 1,504.46 | \$22.91 |

## Deductible and Out-of-Pocket Maximum Analysis (CY 2010)

- 9,192 distinct members in this period
- \$38,755,211 in claims
- Members paid \$6,315,718
- HPHC paid $\$ 32,439,493$

These costs are not evenly spread across the population:

- $9 \%$ of members had no claims
- $33 \%$ of members met their deductibles
- $15 \%$ of member met their out-of-pocket maximum limits
- The $33 \%$ of members who met their deductibles are responsible for $87 \%$ of the total claim costs.
- The $15 \%$ of members who met their out-of-pocket limits are responsible for $69 \%$ of total claim costs.


## Members who met deductible and proposed deductible increases

| Subsidy level | \% of members who met <br> deductible (2010) | Average amount HPHC paid for <br> members who hit deductible (2010) |
| ---: | ---: | ---: |
|  |  |  |
| B | $41 \%$ | $\$ 7,701.05$ |
| C | $30 \%$ | $\$ 10,896.68$ |
| D | $27 \%$ | $\$ 8,914.79$ |
| E | $26 \%$ | $\$ 16,097.13$ |
| F | $21 \%$ | $\$ 13,981.61$ |

- Amount that HPHC pays includes preventative care and other services subject to co-payments that are not applied against the deductible.

